Central Administrative Tribunal Principal Bench, New Delhi

O.A. No. 2608/2015 M.A No. 2321/2015

New Delhi, This the 21st day of July, 2015

Hon'ble Shri George Paracken, Member (J) Hon'ble Shri Shekhar Agarwal, Member (A)

- Shailendra Kumar Singh, Aged- 57 Years, S/o Late Sh. Rama Pati Singh, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o Chhatrapal Sadan, 11/423, Vikas Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- Hari Shankar Mishra, Aged- 57 Years, S/o Late Sh. Chaturgun Mishra, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 3/152, Vipul Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- Vinod Kumar Arya, Aged- 45 Years, S/o Late Sh. Lal Ji Prasad, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 548, Chha/05A, Nav Manak Nagar, Dhaindhakhera RDSO, Lucknow (UP).
- 4. Dilip Kumar, Aged- 48 Years, S/o Sh. Kare Din, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o D-13, Doordarshan Colony, Viraj Khand-1, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- Achchhe Lal Verma, Aged- 56 Years, S/o Late Sh. Ram Dev, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 243, Patel Nagar Yojna, Sector-8, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- Bhairaw Yadaw, Aged- 51 Years, S/o Late Sh. Bhrigunath Yadaw, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o A-216, Dayal Residency, Chinhat, Lucknow (UP).

- 7. S. K. Tarafdar, Aged- 55 Years, S/o Late Sh. Shibtosh Tarafdar, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 51-183, Vishwas Expandable, Suraksha-1, Udyan-II, Eldico Colony, Rae Bareli Road, Lucknow (UP).
- B. Dev Karan Prasad, Aged- 51 Years, S/o Sh. M. Prasad, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 441 RN/129, Pragati Vihar, Balaganj Chowk, Lucknow (UP).
- 9. Piyush Kumar Tripathi, Aged- 45 Years, S/o Sh. Durga Prasad Tripathi, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o Basant Vihar, Kamata, Lucknow (UP).
- Ravi Sinha, Aged- 51 Years, S/o Sh. Sati Prasad Srivastava, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o C-13, Sector-A, Mahanagar, Lucknow (UP).
- Mohd. Sarvar Ansari, Aged- 43 Years, S/o Sh. Mohd. Usman Ansari, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 610/2275, Bari Enclave, Keshav Nagar, Sitapur Road, Lucknow (UP).
- Ramesh Kumar Ram, Aged- 48 Years, S/o Sh. Munnar Ram, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 631/94, Ehsan Nagar, Near Sector-9, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- Ravindra Naithani, Aged- 50 Years, S/o Sh. B. N. Naithani, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Aizawl (Mizoram). R/o A-717, New HAL Colony, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- Sandeep Srivastava, Aged- 46 Years, S/o Late Sh. R. C. Lal, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 15, Firoz Gandhi Colony, New Sector-E, Ali Ganj, Lucknow (UP).

- Rajesh Chandra Gupta, Aged- 51 Years, S/o Sh. Ram Kumar Gupta, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 163, Shekhwara, Unnao (UP).
- Prem Pal Singh, Aged- 54 Years, S/o Sh. Gajraj Singh, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Kanpur (UP). R/o Usha Residency, B-130, Sector-C, Mahanagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 17. Jamil Ahmed, Aged- 58 Years, S/o Late Sh. Sharif Ahmed, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 115, Bari Enclave, Keshav Nagar, Sitapur road, Lucknow (UP).
- Mohd. Aftab Ahmad, Aged- 50 Years, S/o Late Sh. Moharram Ali, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Udhampur (J&K). R/o 119/129, Qandhari Bazar, Lal Bagh, Lucknow (UP).
- Raju Bhatnagar, Aged- 53 Years, S/o Sh. H. S. S. Bhatnagar, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 4, Tehri Bazar, Molviganj, Lucknow (UP).
- 20. Rohit Kumar Bhatt, Aged- 50 Years, S/o Sh. V. D. Bhatt, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 2/45, Virat Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 21. Rajendra Kumar Gupta, Aged- 53 Years, S/o Sh. S. N. Gupta, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 28, Manas Enclave, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- Manoj Kumar Bajpai, Aged- 47 Years, S/o Sh. P. K. Bajpai, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 1/573, Vishal Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).

- 23. Raj Narayan, Aged- 46 Years, S/o Late Sh. Ram Jiyawan Verma, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 920-H, Manav Nagar, Krishna Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 24. G. D. Mishra, Aged- 54 Years, S/o Late Sh. H. B. Mishra, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Kohima (Nagaland). R/o 2/78, Vishal Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 25. Umesh Chandra Saxena, Aged- 63 Years, S/o Late Sh. Tara Chand Saxena, Assistant Engineer (Retired), Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 222, MMD1, Sector-D1, LDA Colony, Kanpur Road, Lucknow (UP).
- 26. Radhey Shyam, Aged- 54 Years, S/o Late Sh. Durga Prasad, Working as Assistant Director (E), Akashvani Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 3/31, Vibhav Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 27. Shobhan Ghosh, Aged- 58 Years, S/o Late Sh. H. N. Ghosh, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o C-497/B, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 28. Vinod Kumar Vaishnav, Aged- 49 Years, S/o Sh. R. D. Vaishnav, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o E-41, Kurmanchal Nagar, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 29. Sumonto Gupto, Aged- 53 Years, S/o Late Sh. R. N. Gupto, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Leh (J&K). R/o 201, Greenwood Appt, B-21, Sector-E (New), Aliganj, Lucknow (UP).
- 30. Shakti Pratap Kanchan, Aged- 47 Years, S/o Late Sh. Surya Prakash Kanchan, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 539/120-Kha, Bari Jugauli, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).

- K. D. Srivastava, Aged- 52 Years, S/o Sh. Adya Lal Srivastava, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 238, Patel Nagar Yojna, Near Sector-8, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 32. Ram Avtar Yadav, Aged- 53 Years, S/o Sh. Chhotu Ram Yadav, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 11/396, Vikas Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 33. Vinod Kumar Tiwari, Aged- 52 Years, S/o J. P. Tiwari, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 34, Vaishali Enclave, Indira Nagar, Sector-9, Lucknow (UP).
- 34. Vishwa Nath Ram, Aged- 53 Years, S/o Late Sh. Ram Charan, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 582/1132, Badalikhera, PO-Manas Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 35. Yogendra Bahadur Singh, Aged- 45 Years, S/o Late Sh. Hira Lal, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 2/433, Viram Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- Sunil Kumar Srivastava, Aged- 52 Years, S/o Late Sh. Shyam Kishor Lal, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 2/60, Virat Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 37. Pradeep Kumar Tripathi, Aged- 49 Years, S/o Late Sh. K. N. Tripathi, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o E-1/752, Sector-H, LDA Colony, Kanpur Road, Lucknow (UP).
- Brij Mohan, Aged- 53 Years,
 S/o Late Sh. Mahangu,
 Working as Assistant Engineer,
 Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP).
 R/o Sector-11/507, Indira Nagar,
 Lucknow (UP).

- Sanjay Kumar Saxena, Aged- 49 Years, S/o Sh. Anand Swaroop Saxena, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o D-3113, D-Block, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 40. Ravi Shanker, Aged- 46 Years, S/o Late Sh. Uma Shankar, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o D-2/79, Viraj Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 41. Bhagawat Gond, Aged- 52 Years, S/o Late Sh. Chandra Dev Gond, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Pauri (UK). R/o 6/393, Vineet Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 42. Savitur Prakash, Aged- 43 Years, S/o Sh. A. L. Srivastava, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Shimla (HP). R/o 268, Uphar, Eldeco-Udyan-1, PO-Bhadrukh Jail Road, Lucknow (UP).
- 43. Rajesh Verma, Aged- 45 Years, S/o Sh. V. P. Verma, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 2/730, Sector-H, Janakipuram, Lucknow (UP).
- 44. Meena Verma, Aged- 47 Years, D/o Sh. M. P. Verma, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Srinagar (J&K). R/o Flat-1, T. G. Road Hostel, Khadra Chowk, Lucknow (UP).
- 45. Ram Mani Mishra, Aged- 45 Years, S/o Sh. Raja Ram Mishra, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 11, Ram Nagar Phase-2, Satbari Road, Kanpur (UP).
- 46. N. K. Gogia, Aged- 66 Years,
 S/o Late Sh. K. L. Gogia,
 Assistant Engineer (Retired),
 Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP).
 R/o A-1094, Indira Nagar,
 Lucknow (UP).

- 47. Vijay Kumar Anil, Aged- 55 Years, S/o Late Sh. Balla Ram, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra (DMC), Rajouri (J&K). R/o LS-2/631, Sector-F, Janakipuram, Lucknow (UP).
- 48. Kaushalendra Singh Chauhan, Aged- 48 Years, S/o Sh. R. B. Singh Chauhan, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 16/664, Sector-16, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 49. Raj Kumar Bhutani, Aged- 62 Years, S/o Sh. Khushi Ram Bhutani, Assistant Engineer (Retired), Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o D-1/184, Sector-H, LDA Colony, Kanpur Road, Lucknow (UP).
- 50. Om Prakash Gupta, Aged- 68 Years, S/o Late Sh. Sant Bakhsh Gupta, Assistant Engineer (Retired), Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o MM-1/855, Vinay Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 51. Ram Murti, Aged- 56 Years, S/o Late Sh. Ram Samujh, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o G 41-A, Sanjay Gandhi Puram, Faizabad Road, Lucknow (UP).
- 52. Sushil Kumar Shukla, Aged- 49 Years, S/o Sh. K. B. Shukla, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 142/3, J. K. Colony, Jajmau, Kanpur (UP).
- 53. Umesh Chandra Tripathi, Aged- 46 Years, S/o Sh. Govardhan Tripathi, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o M-53, Indralok Colony, Krishna Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 54. Sudhir Nigam, Aged- 58 Years,
 S/o Late Sh. Om Prakash Nigam,
 Working as Assistant Engineer,
 Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP).
 R/o 62, Eldeco Colony, Malhour Road, Vikalp Khand,
 Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).

- 55. Navin Chandra Joshi, Aged- 51 Years, S/o Sh. Dharma Nand Joshi, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Haldwani (UK). R/o Sarvodaya Vihar, Bari Mukhani, Haldwani (UK).
- 56. Rajnish Kumar, Aged- 44 Years, S/o Sh. Paragi Lal, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 655A/4/128, Gayatripuram, Kursi Road, Lucknow (UP).
- 57. Munna Rao, Aged- 42 Years, S/o Sh. Ram Kishun, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 14/1163, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 58. Sanjay Kumar, Aged- 45 Years, S/o Sh. Raj Narayan, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o D-1362, Indira Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 59. Raj Kumar, Aged- 43 Years, S/o Sh. Kishori Lal, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 2/122, Vastu Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 60. Lal Sahab, Aged- 48 Years, S/o Sh. Sita Ram, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 14/417, Vikas Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 61. Tara Chand, Aged- 51 Years, S/o Sh. Baldi Prasad, Working as Assistant Engineer, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o 6/1012, Janakipuram Extn, Lucknow (UP).
- 62. Shyam Kishor Vaishya, Aged- 47 Years, S/o Sh. Brahma Nand Vaishya, Working as Sr. Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Rudauli (UP). R/o 538KA/1404 (548), Triveni Nagar-II, Lucknow (UP).

- 63. Basant Kumar Singh, Aged- 44 Years, S/o Late Sh. R. F. Singh, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o N-112, Keshavpuram, Awas Vikas No.1, Kalyanpur, Kanpur (UP).
- 64. Krishna Kumar, Aged- 47 Years,
 S/o Late Sh. Babu Ram Mishra,
 Working as Engineering Assistant,
 Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP).
 R/o N-338, Keshavpuram, Awas Vikas No.1,
 Kalyanpur, Kanpur (UP).
- 65. Navendu Srivastava, Aged- 41 Years, S/o Late Sh. Gomati Sharan Srivastava, Working as Engineering Assistant, Akashvani Kendra, Kanpur (UP). R/o C-7, Radio Colony, Benajhabar Road, Kanpur (UP).
- 66. Anil Kumar, Aged- 45 Years, S/o Sh. Raja Ram, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Etawah (UP). R/o H-1383, Satyam Vihar, Awas Vikas No.1, Kalyanpur, Kanpur (UP).
- 67. Rajio Kumar Tripathi, Aged- 43 Years, S/o Sh. Rajendra Tripathi, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Muzaffarpur (Bihar). R/o At Luathali Bazar, PO-Laxmipur, Deoria (UP).
- 68. Virendra Verma, Aged- 42 Years, S/o Sh. Ram Kumar Verma, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o C-6, Doordarshan Colony, Viraj Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 69. Uma Shanker Mishra, Aged- 50 Years, S/o Sh. Bhagawati Prasad Mishra, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o D-29, Doordarshan Colony, Viraj Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 70. Akhilesh Kumar Srivastava, Aged- 41 Years, S/o Sh. Y. N. P. Srivastava, Working as Engineering Assistant, Doordarshan Kendra, Lucknow (UP). R/o D-7, Doordarshan Colony, Viraj Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).

- 71. Kailash Prasad, Aged- 53 Years, S/o Late Sh. P. R. Chaudhary Working as Senior Engineering Assistant Doordarshan Kendra, Kanpur (UP) R/o 42, Dwarika Vihar, PO-CMAP, Lucknow(UP)
- 72. Subhash Chandra Srivastava, Aged- 61 Years, S/o Late Sh. Lalta Prasad, Assistant Engineer (Retired), Doordarshan Kendra, Rudauli (UP). R/o 2/113, Viraj Khand, Gomati Nagar, Lucknow (UP).
- 73. Jagtar Singh, Aged- 67 Years, S/o Late S. Rattan Singh, Sr. Engineering Assistant (Retired), Akashvani Kendra, Jalandhar (Pb). R/o 1730, Old Lakkar Mandi, Amritsar (Pb).
- 74. Vijay Kumar Chugh, Aged- 69 Years, S/o Late Sh. S. N. Chugh, Assistant Engineer (Retired), Doordarshan Kendra, Delhi. R/o Site-3, House No. 197, Vikas Puri, New Delhi.

..... Applicants

(By Advocate: Sh. Yogesh Sharma)

Versus

- 1. Union of India , through the Secretary, Ministry of Information & Broadcasting, Govt. of India, Shastri Bhawan, Dr. R. P. Marg, New Delhi-110001.
- 2. Prasar Bharati (Broadcasting Corp. of India), Through Chief Executive Officer, PTI Building, Sansad Marg, New Delhi-110001.
- 3. Director General, Akashvani, Akashvani Bhawan, Sansad Marg, New Delhi-110001.
- 4. Director General, Doordarshan, Doordarshan Bhawan Wing-A, Copernicus Marg, New Delhi-110001.

.....Respondents

<u>ORDER (ORAL)</u>

Shri. G. George Paracken, Member (J) :

M.A No. 2321/2015 :

This M.A has been filed by the applicant for joining together in the O.A. For the reasons stated herein, the M.A is allowed.

O.A No. 2608/2015 :

The applicant has filed this 0.A seeking the following reliefs:-

- a) Direct the respondents to extend the benefits of the judgment dated 07.09.2009 passed by Hon'ble CAT, Patna Bench in O.A 514/2002 to the applicants herein in the grades of Engineering Assistants, Sr. Engineering Assistants and Assistant Engineers of AIR & Doordarshan who have been in service on or/and after 09.08.1999, without resorting to court case for the same relief.
- b) Direct the respondents to grant the benefits of the ACP Scheme in accordance with the rules and law and as per the directions passed by order dated 23.05.2012 of Hon'ble CAT, Patna bench in CCPA No. 22 of 2011 in OA No. 514 of 2012 of going by the letter and spirit of the entire order of the Tribunal in the O.A as well as the order of Hon'ble High Court in CWJC and clarifications given by DOP&T, instead of going by literal meaning of the order passed in para-9 of the order of Hon'ble Tribunal in OA; and which has been complied with by the respondents in the pay fixation order dated 20.08.2013 in respect of pay of Sh. B. K. Roy, SEA.
- c) Direct the respondents to grant 1st financial upgradation in the Pay scales of Rs. 8000-275-13500 after completion of 12 years of service counting it from the date of direct recruitment in service and thereafter, 2nd financial upgradation in the pay scale of Rs. 10000-325-15200 after completion of 24 years of service in accordance with the scheme of the ACP with effect from the dates applicable in each individual cases, along with arrears of pay and consequential benefits, etc.
- d) Grant cost in favour of the applicants, and pass any other or further order(s) in favour of the applicants, which this Hon'ble Tribunal may deem fit, just and proper in the above mentioned facts and circumstances.

2. Learned counsel for the applicant submits that his case is squarely covered by the order dated 07.09.2009 passed by the Patna Bench of this Tribunal in O.A 514/2002 Akashwani & Doordarshan Diploma Engineers Association through its President name Brij Kishore Roy Vs. Union of India & Ors. The operative part of the said order reads as under :-

- "8. After hearing both the counsels and after perusing the records, we have come to the conclusion that the applicants are entitled for grant of ACP promotion and this promotion should be granted in the pay scale of Assistant Executive Engineer i.e. Rs. 8000-13500/-.
- 9. This O.A is therefore, allowed. The respondents are directed to grant the applicants the pay scale of Rs.8000-13500 as and when they have completed 12 years service in pay scale of Rs.6000-10500. The arrears should also be paid to the applicants. The respondents are directed to issue orders regarding ACP promotion to the applicants

within a period of two months from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment. The arrears may be calculated and paid to them within one month thereafter.

10. With these directions, this O.A stands disposed of. No costs."

3. Sh. Rajeev Sharma, learned counsel appeared on behalf of the respondents No. 2 to 5 on receipt of the advance copy of the O.A.

4. In view of the above submissions made by the learned counsel for the applicants, this O.A is disposed of with the direction to the respondents to examine the case of the applicants in the light of the order of this Tribunal in O.A 514/2002 (supra). If their cases are covered by the aforesaid order, they shall also be granted the same benefits. The respondents shall also pass individual orders in the cases of the applicants under intimation to them. The aforesaid directions shall be complied with within two weeks from the date of receipt of a copy of this order. There shall be no order as to costs.

(Shekhar Agarwal) Member(A) (G. George Paracken) Member (J)

/Mbt/