# CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL PRINCIPAL BENCH

OA No.854 of 2014

New Delhi, this the 15th day of May, 2014

# HON'BLE SHRI G. GEORGE PARACKEN, MEMBER (J) HON'BLE SHRI SHEKHAR AGARWAL, MEMBER (A)

- Yogendra Pal Singh, S/o Shri Gajendra Pal Singh, Working as Assistant Engineer, O/o ADG(E),North Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, New Delhi. R/o 603/UG-3, Shalimar Garden Ext.1, Sahibabad-201005, Distt-Ghaziabad (UP).
- Prakash Chandra Pandey, S/o Sh. B. D. Pandey Working as Assistant Engineer.
   O/o ADG(E), R&D, AIR & Doordarshan, New Delhi. R/o 173/SF-4, Sector-6, Vaishali, Ghaziabad-201010 (UP).
- Bani Singh, S/o Sh. Panna Lal, Working as Assistant Engineer.
   O/o ADG(E), R&D, AIR & Doordarshan, New Delhi. R/o D-3/11, Radio Colony, Kingway, Delhi-100009.
- Mrs. Seema Bhatnagar, W/o Sh. D. K. Bhatnagar,
   Working as Senior Engineering Assistant.
   O/o ADG(E), R&D. AIR & Doordarshan, New Delhi.
   R/o 133, Charak sadan. E-Block, Vikaspuri,
   New Delhi-110018.
- Anurag Shrivastav, S/o Late Sh. Dr.R. C. Shrivastav, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Kohima (Nagaland). R/o B-2, Bunglow, Akashvani Vihar, Colony Residency Area, Indore (MP).
- Vivek D. Kasture, S/o Late Sh. D. R. Kasture, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Indore (MP).
   R/o 40, Sai Vihar Colony, Post-Tilak Nagar, Indore-452018 (MP).
- 7. Sunil Kumar Tare, S/o Shri G. M. Tare, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Indore (MP).

  R/o 166, Tilak Nagar (Main).
  Indore (MP).

Shripad Kalyani, S/o Sh. M. B. Kalyani, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Indore (MP). R/o 27-A, Shriji Vatika, Near Pipliya Hana, Indore-452018 (MP).



- Sheikh Sirajuddin, S/o Late Sh. Sadruddin, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Indore (MP).
   74/81, Kanchan Vihar Colony, MHOW, Indore-453441 (MP).
- Purushottam Das Koshta, S/o Sh. C. L. Koshta, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Indore (MP).
   R/o 180-A, Veena Nagar Annex, Prime City, Indore (MP).
- Mohd. Zahiruddin Qureshi, S/o Sh. Rafiuddin Qureshi, Working as Senior Engineeing Assistant, TVRC, Shajapur (MP).
   R/o Badshahi Road, Near Jama Masjid, Shajapur-465001 (MP).
- V. K. Shrivastava, S/o Late Sh. A. R. shrivastava, Working as Senior Engineeing Assistant, TVRC, Vindhyanagar, Singrauli (MP). R/o NH-1B/248, NTPC Colony, VSTPP, Vindhyanagar, Singraili-486885 (MP).
- 13. Ashok Kumar Soni, S/o Sh. B. L. Soni, Working as Assistant Engineer, TVRC, Mandsaur (MP).
  R/o 88, Abhinandan Nagar Ext. 1, Mandsaur-458001 (MP).
- 14. Mrs. Sandhya Kanoongo, W/o Manglesh Kanoongo, Working as Senior Engineeing Assistant, TVRC, Mandsaur (MP). R/o 65, Shivji Baser Nagar, Near RTO, Mandsaur-458001 (MP).
- Surendra Pal Sharma, S/o Sh. H. P. Sharma, Assistant Engineer (Retired), DDK, Bhopal (MP).
   R/o 6, Aradhana Nagar, Kotra Sultanabad, Bhopal-462003 (MP).
- Mahendra Kr Pamecha, S/o Sh. Surajmal Pamecha, Assistant Engineer, TVRC, Kukdeshwar (MP). R/o Nondram Malvya, Behind Police Colony, Kukdeshwar-458116 (MP).
- Sunil Kumar Jain, S/o Sh. Shantilal Jain, Assistant Engineer,
  TVRC, Neemuch (MP).
  R/o 18, Dayanand Marg,
  Ncemuch-458441 (MP).



- Satish Chandra Rathore, S/o Sh. B. L. Rathore, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, TVRC, Ratlam (MP).
   R/o H. No.01, MDX-01, Ratan Puri, Ratlam-457001 (MP).
- Pooram Mal Meena, S/o Sh. Ramswaroop Meena, Working as Engineering Assistant, TVRC, Sitamau (MP). R/o C/o R. C. Sharma, Post Office Road, Sitamau-458990 (MP).
- 20. Om Prakash Meena, S/o Sh. P.L. Meena, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, TVRC, Bhanpura (under DMC, Ratlam) (MP). R/o F1-145, Vivek Vihar, Jagath Pura, Jaipur-302017 (Rajasthan).
- 21. Radhe Shyam Meena, S/o Sh. M. L. Meena, Working as Engineering Assistant, TVRC, Bhanpura (under DMC, Ratlam) (MP). R/o B-70, New Jawahar Nagar, Kota-324005 (Rajasthan).
- V. K. Thomas, S/o Late Sh. V. T. Koshy,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  TVRC, Adoor (Kerala).
  R/o Santhi Bhawan, Thumpamon Thazham PO,
  Pathanamthitta-689625 (Kerala).
- 23. K. S. Sasidharan, S/o Sh. K. Sankaran, Assistant Engineer (Retired), DMC, Kochin (Kerala). R/o MIG-166, Gandhinagar, Kadavanthra PO, Kochi-682020 (Kerala).
- 24. K. K. Jose, S/o Sh. Kochappen,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  AIR, Alappuzha (Kerala).
  R /o Thattil Kockey House, Thalore PO, Ollur,
  Thrissur-680306 (Kerala).
- C. P. Subramanaian, S/o Sh. Pengan,
   Assistant Engineer (Retired),
   AIR, Alappuzha (Kerala).
   R/o Cheruparambil House, Mathew Nagar, W. Chalakudy
   PO, Thrissur-680307 (Kerala).
  - K. K. Viswanathan, S/o Sh. K. S. Krishnan, Assistant Engineer (Retired), AIR, Trivandrum (Kerala). R/o Pura-110, Nallath Temple Road, Poojappura PO, Trivandrum-695012.



- N. Aravindan, S/o Sh. A. Narayana Pillai, Assistant Engineer (Retired), AIR, Trivandrum (Kerala). R/o Lekshmi Nivas, Mullancode, Edaicode-629152, Distt-Kanyakumari.
- 28. K. S. Krishnamma, D/o Sh. C. Sankar,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  DDK, Trivandrum (Kerala).
  R/o TC6/94(2), Lakshmiprasadam, Prasanth Nagar,
  Ulloor Medical College P.o., Trivandrum-695011.
- Paul J Pereira, S/o Sh. Joseph V Pereira,
   Assistant Engineer (Retired),
   DDK, Trivandrum (Kerala).
   R/o Carmel House, St. Andrews,
   PO-St. Xaviers College, Trivandrum-695586 (Kerala).
- 30. S. Vijayakumar, S/o Sh. M. Sadanandan, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Trivandrum (Kerala). R/o Deepam, KP, XI/647, Peroorkada PO, Trivandrum-695005 (Kerala).
- 31. Mrs. M. Prema, D/o Sh. S. Murugesan,
  Working as Assistant Engineer,
  DDK, Trivandrum (Kerala).
  R/o K. K. Gardens No.10, VP2/429, Indira Nagar,
  Peroorkada PO, Trivandrum-695005 (Kerala).
- 32. D. Ravikumar, S/o Sh. M. G. Damodaran Nair, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Trivandrum (Kerala). R/o Karammel, Karikodu, Kottayam-686610 (Kerala).
- 33. K. S. Moley, S/o Late Sh. K. C. Skaria,
  Working as Assistant Engineer,
  DDK, Trivandrum (Kerala).
  R/o H. No. 84, NCC Nagar, Peroorkada PO,
  Trivandrum-695005.
- 34. Assain Panikkarakathu, S/o Sh. Aboobacker C., Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Trivandrum (Kerala). R/o TC 9/964, Love Dale, Paniker's lane, Sasthamangalam, Trivandrum (Kerala).
  - 35. Abraham John, S/o Sh. C. C. John, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, R/o Pampalimannil, PLRA 134, Panachamoodu Lane, Pattom, Trivandrum-695004 (Kerala).



- Asoke Roy
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  AIR, Kolkata (WB).
  R/o B-18/1, Kalindi Housing Estate,
  Kolkata-700089 (WB).
- 37. Sati Kinkar Bhattacharya, S/o Late Sh. J.N. Bhattacharya, Assistant Engineer (Retired), AIR, Kolkata (WB). R/o BK-298, Salt Lake City, Sector-II, Kolkata-700091 (WB).
- 38. Amiya Kumar Roy, S/o Late Sh. P. R. Roy, Assistant Engineer (Retired), DDK, Kolkata (WB). R/o Mukherjee Bagan, Po-Chinsurah, Hooghly-712102 (WB).
- 39. Somnath Gangopadhyay, S/o Late Sh. P. N. Gangopadhyay, Assistant Engineer (Retired), o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB). R/o 55, Dharmatola Lane, PO-Shibpur, Howrah-711102 (WB).
- 40. Hara Nath Das, S/o late Sh. D. N. Das;
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  DDK, Kolkata (WB).
  R/o Raj Apartment, 41/3 Prince Golam Hossain Shah Road,
  Jadavpur, Kolkata-700032 (WB).
- 41. Arun Kumar Sarkar, S/o Late Sh. M. K. Sarkar, Assistant Engineer (Retired), o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB). R/o Mandirpara (Beside Children's Park), Po-Rahara, North 24 Parganas-700118 (WB).
- 42. Sushil Kumar Das, S/o Late Sh. M. B. Das, Assistant Engineer (Retired), o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB). R/o 2/90B, Vidyasagar Colony, Kolkata-700047 (WB).
- Ajoy Kumar Mukherjee, S/o Late Sh. P. C. Mukherjee,
   Assistant Engineer (Retired),
   DDK, Kolkata (WB).
   R/o Narendrapur Housing Coop. Society Ltd, Tegharia,
   Sonarpur, Kolkata-700150 (WB).
- Mrs. Anjali Bhattacharya, W/o Sh. S. K. Bhattacharya, Assistant Engineer (Retired), o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB). R/o BK-298, Salt Lake City, Sector-II, Kolkata-700091 (WB).



- 45. Mrs. Sibani Banerjee, W/o Sh. Ashok Kumar Banerjee, Assistant Engineer (Retired), AIR, Kolkata (WB). R/o 1st Brajo Chandra Lane, Kamarpara, PO-Chinsurah, Hooghly-712101 (WB).
- 46. Anil Kumar Ghosh, S/o Late Sh. Panchanan Ghosh, Assistant Engineer (Retired), o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB). R/o 59, Chatterjee Bagan, PO-Chinsurah RS, Hooghly-712101 (WB).
- 47. Sudip Kumar Chakraborty,
  S/o Late Sh. P. K. Chakraborty,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB).
  R/o E-4/5, Purbasha Housing Estate,
  160, Maniktola Main Road,
  Kolkata-700054 (WB).
- 48. Saroj Kumar Kirtania, S/o Late Sh. S. C. Kirtania, Assistant Engineer (Retired), HPT, AIR, Chinsurah. R/o 65/A/33, Tirinji Danga Road, PO-Mallickpara, Hooghly-712203 (WB).
- 49. Tripura Sankar Chatterjee, S/o Late Sh. Chandidas Chatterjee, Assistant Engineer (Retired), DDK, Kolkata (WB). R/o 6/1/1A,Padda Pukur Road, Kolkata-700092 (WB).
- 50. Phanindra Nath Biswas, S/o Late Sh. M. C. Biswas, Assistant Engineer (Retired), AIR, Kolkata (WB). R/o 5/4, Purbachal Link Road, PO-Haltu, Kolkata-700078 (WB).
- 51. Dilip Kumar Roy, S/o Late Sh. P. K. Roy,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB).
  R/o C/64/1, Sarada Park, Maheshtala,
  Kolkata-700141 (WB).
- 52. Bibhas Kar, S/o Late Sh. Suresh Kar,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB).
  R/o B-14/216, Kendriya Vihar, VIP Road, PO-Airport,
  Kolkata-700052 (WB).

Suprakash Nayak, S/o Late Sh. Benimadhab Nayak, Assistant Engineer (Retired), o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB). R/o Dwarik Jungle Road, PO-Bhadrakali, Hooghly-712232 (WB).



- 54. Samir Kumar Banerjee, S/o Late Sh. Krishnadhan Banerjee, Assistant Engineer (Retired), HPT, AIR, Chinsurah. R/o Purnamalhuri, Bhuban Chandra Bhas Road, Chandan Nagar, Hooghly-712136 (WB).
- 55. Subrata Banerjee, S/o late Sh. Sunil Banerjee, Assistant Engineer (Retired), AIR, Kolkata (WB). R/o 46A, Dakshin Behala Road, PO-Sursuna, Kolkata-700061 (WB).
- 56. Arup Kumar Panti, S/o Sh. B. C. Panti,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  DDK, Krishnanagar (WB).
  R/o Mousumu Apartment, 505, Dum Dum Park,
  Kolkata-700055 (WB).
- 57. Dipak Chakrabarti, S/o Late Sh. Bhubijoy Chakraborty, Assistant Engineer (Retired), o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB). R/o 3/44, Dakshin Behala Road, PO-Sursuna, Kolkata-700061 (WB).
- 58. Madhusudan Rajbanshi, S/o Late Sh. H. M. Rajbanshi, Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  AIR, Kolkata (WB).
  R/o Vill-Muragacha, PO-Jugberia, 24 Parganas (N),
  Kolkata-700110 (WB).
- 59. Birinchi Pada Mandal, S/o Late Sh. N. N. Mandal, Assistant Engineer (Retired), AIR, Kolkata (WB). R/o A-2/39A, Diamond Park, Joka, Kolkata-700104 (WB).
- Uday Kumar Khan, S/o Late Sh. D. N. Khan,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  TVRC, Ranaghat (under DMC, Burdwan).
  R/o 144/8, Jessore Road (East), Bijoynagar,
  PO-Kazipara, 24 Parganas (N), Kolkata-700125 (WB).
- 61. Swapan Kumar Das, S/o Late Sh. Sudhir Das,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  o/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Kolkata (WB).
  R/o 37, Prantik Sarani, Rabindra Nagar,
  Kolkata-700065 (WB).

Swapan Saha, S/o Late Sh. S. P. Saha, Assistant Engineer (Retired), DDK, Kolkata (WB). R/o 36A, Bikram Garh, Jadavpur, Kolkata-700032 (WB).



- 63. Sambhu Nath Datta, S/o Late Shri Harihar Datta, Assistant Engineer (Retired), TVRC, Kokrajhar (Assam). R/o Dinhata, Ward-6, House No. 34, PO-Dinhata, Coochbehar-736135 (WB).
- 64. P. Dhanapal, S/o Sh. A. Perumal,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  O/o ADG(E), South Zone, AIR & Doordarshan, Chennai.
  R/o 6, Cauvery Nagar, Urapakkam,
  Chennai-603210 (Tamilnadu).
- 65. K. Kanniah, S/o Late Sh. M. Kanniah Reddy, Assistant Engineer (Retired), HPT, AIR, Avadi, Chennai. R/o 4, 1st Cross, Bharathiyar Street, Solambedu, Thirumullaivoyal, Chennai-600062.
- 66. M. Sujatha, D/o Sh. M. Michael, Working as Assistant Engineer, HPT, AIR, Avadi, Chennai. R/o C-4, Radio Colony, HPT, AIR, Avadi, Chennai-600062.
- 67. V. Niranjan Reddy, S/o Sh. V. Changa Reddy, Working as Assistant Engineer, HPT, AIR, Avadi, Chennai. R/o 4-35, S. K.Nagar, M. R. Pally, Tirupati (AP).
- 68. S. V. Subramanian, S/o Sh. K. S. Venkata Rao, Working as Assistant Engineer, HPT, AIR, Avadi, Chennai. R/o G-6, Ezhil Castle, B-26, 1st Main Road, T. Nagar, Ambattur, Chennai.
- 69. R. Lakshminarayanan, S/o Sh. A. Rajagopalan, Working as Assistant Engineer, HPT, AIR, Avadi, Chennai. R/o F-2, Elite Enclave, C.T.H. Road, Thirumullaivoyil, Chennai-600109.
- 70. R. Munuswamy, S/o Sh E. Ranga Rao, Working as Assistant Engineer, HPT, AIR, Avadi, Chennai. R/o No.2, 9th Street, Thiruvalluvar Nagar, Thirumullaivoyal, Chennai-600062.
  - N. Murali, S/o Sh. B. Natarajan, Working as Assistant Engineer, HPT, AIR, Avadi, Chennai. R/o 17/7, 23<sup>rd</sup> Street, Villivakkam, Chennai-600049.

- 72. C. Anandan, S/o Late Sh. N. Chockalaingam,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  AIR, Chennai.
  R/o H. No.1A, 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, New Colony, Pallikaranai,
  Chennai-600100.
- 73. Mrs Malathi Anandan, W/o Sh. C. Anandan,
  Assistant Engineer (V. Rtd),
  DDK, Chennai.
  R/o H. No.1A, 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, New Colony, Pallikaranai,
  Chennai-600100.
- 74. S. Veerasamy, S/o Late Sh. B. Santhanam,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  DDK, Chennai.
  R/o 321/9, Kathiravan Colony, Anna Nagar West,
  Chennai-600040.
- 75. P. V. Sathyanarayanan, S/o Sh. P. N. Venkatraman, Assistant Engineer (Retired), DDK, Chennai. R/o F2, Sakthiganapathy Apartment, No.23/7, Lakshminagar Extn, Chromepet, Chennai-600044.
- 76. S. V. Sampath Kumar, S/o Sh. S. R. Venkatesan, Assistant Engineer (Retired), DDK, Chennai. R/o Flat 4, Marvel Court, New No.5, old No.3, Mandaveli Street, Mandaveli, Chennai-600028.
- 77. K. Venugopalan, S/o Sh. P. C. Govindan Nair, Assistant Engineer (Retired), DDK, Chennai. R/o Sreepournami, Azhinhilam Post, Mallapuram-673632 (Kerala).
- 78. B. Babu, S/o Sh. B. Kumaraswamy,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  DDK, Chennai.
  R/o H-29/27, Ashtalakshmi Garden, Besant Nagar,
  Chennai-600090.
- Susiladevi Srinivasarao, W/o Sh. Srinivasarao,
   Working as Assistant Engineer,
   DDK, Chennai.
   R/o 14/109, CPWD Quarters, Indiranagar, Adyar,
   Chennai-600020.
- 30. S. Murali, S/o Sh. S. S. srinivasan,
  Working as Assistant Engineer,
  DDK, Chennai.
  R/o 34, Arimuthu Achari Street, Triplicane,
  Chennai-600005.



- S. Padmalata, D/o Sh. K. Chitti Babu Naidu, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Chennai.
   R/o 19/2, 5th Street, Dr. Subburaya Nagar, Kodambakkam, Chennai-600024.
- N. Usharani, D/o Sh. S. Natarajan,
   Working as Assistant Engineer,
   DDK, Chennai.
   R/o 20/153, CPWD Quarters, Indiranagar, Adyar,
   Chennai-600020.
- S. Gurumanickam, S/o Sh. A. Srinivasan, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Chennai.
   R/o 11, 4th Street, Sriram Nagar, Selaiyur, Chennai-600073.
- P. Prakasan, S/o Sh. Chandu Nair P.K.,
  Working as Assistant Engineer,
  DDK, Chennai.
  R/o 24/3, CPWD Quarters, Besant Nagar,
  Chennai-600090.
- 85. J. Lakshmi Narasimsan, S/o Sh. T. V. Jayaraman, Working as Assistant Engineer,
  DDK, Chennai.
  R/o 4/30, CPWD Quarters, 4th Main Road, Indiranagar, Adyar,
  Chennai-600020.
- R. Arul, S/o Sh. Ramakrishnan,
  Working as Assistant Engineer,
  DDK, Chennai.
  R/o 5, Aacini Nagar, Thirumullaivoyal,
  Chennai-600062.
- K. Balaji, S/o Sh. J. Kailasam,
  Working as Assistant Engineer,
  DDK, Chennai.
  R/o 178A, Parvathy Nagar, 8th Cross Street,
  Madambakkam, Chennai-600073.
- R. Sukumaran, S/o Sh. E. Rajagopalan, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Chennai.
   R/o 107, East Vaninar Street, K.K.Nagar West, Chennai-600078.
  - V. Sridharan, S/o Sh. V. Venkata Narasu, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Chennai. R/o G5, Ganpath Arcade, No.1 Padmavathi Nagar, Virugambakkam, Chennai-600092.



- S. Meenakshi, D/o Sh. V. S. Eswaran, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Chennai.
   R/o 27/5, CPWD Quarters, Besant Nagar, 2<sup>nd</sup> Cross Street, Chennai-600090.
- K. Narayanan, S/o Sh. S. Kannan, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Chennai.
   R/o 95 & 96, 6<sup>th</sup> Cross Street, Rajiv Nagar, Perungudi, Chennai-600096.
- 92. Manikandan P. R., S/o Sh. P. Ramanathan, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Chennai.
  R/o 125/02, CPWD Quarters, K.K.Nagar, Chennai-600078.
- 93. M. Murugaiyan, S/o K. Mariappan,
  Working as Senior Engineering Assistant,
  DDK, Chennai.
  R/o 54, 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue, Ramakrishna Nagar, Porur,
  Chennai-600116.
- 74. T. Tamil Selvi, D/o Sh. T. Arumugam, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Chennai.
  R/o 4B, Anugraha Apartments, 7/9, Dy. Mayor Kabalamoorthy
  Salai, Chintadripet, Chennai-600002.
- 95. C. P. Divakar, S/o Sh. C. G. Pandurangam, Working as Engineering Assistant, DDK, Chennai.
  R/o Plot No.7, New NGO Colony, Plot No.7, New NGO Colony, 2nd Cross Street, Adambakkam, Chennai-600088.
- 96. R. Parvathavarthini, D/o Sh. P. Rajagopalan, Working as Engineering Assistant, DDK, Chennai. R/o W-550-A, G-1, 6<sup>th</sup> Street, Anna Nagar West Extn, Chennai-600101.
- 97. R. Shanmugasundaram, S/o Sh. P. Raju, Working as Engineering Assistant, DDK, Chennai.
  R/o 165/1, Lake View Road, West Mambalam, Chennai-600033.
  - P. Sundaresh, S/o Sh. P. J. Swamy, Working as Engineering Assistant, DDK, Chennai. R/o 5/7A, Sriram Nagar, 2<sup>nd</sup> Cross, Ramapuram, Chennai-600089.



- 99. A. Vasantha Singaraja, D/o Sh. V. Arumugam, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, AIR, Tirunelveli (Tamilnadu). R/o D3, AIR Staff Quarters, Maharaja Nagar, Tirunelveli-627011 (T.N.)
- 100. M. Vallinayagom, S/o Sh. A. Muthukrishnan, Working as Assistant Engineer, TVRC, Nagercoil (Tamilnadu). R/o 118/2D, Shree Hayagriva Bhawan, Rajiv Nagar, Irullappapuram Road, Nagercoil-629002.
- 101. G. Murali, S/o Sh. B. Govindarajan,
  Working as Assistant Engineer
  DMC, Puducherry.
  R/o 9, Pallavan Street, JVS Nagar, Mudaliarpet,
  Puducherry-605004.
- S. Gurumani, S/o Sh. S. Subramanian,
   Working as Senior Engineering Assistant
   DDK, Puducherry.
   R/o 21, Jayaram Garden, 11th Cross Extn,
   Bharathi Nagar, Karuvadikuppam, Puducherry-605008.
- 103. M. Krishna Kumar, S/o Sh. M. Muthu Krishnan, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant DDK, Puducherry R/o 63/2, 35th Azad Street, GKM Colony, Chennai-600082
- 104. M. A. Rahim, S/o Sh. M. A. Rehaman, Working as Assistant Engineer, TVRC, Wanapathy (under DMC, Mehaboobnagar)(AP). R/o 5-3-656, Osman Gunj, Hyderabad-500012 (AP).
- 105. O. Subramanyam, S/o Sh. O. Nagaiah, Working as Assistant Engineer, TVRC, Rajampeta (AP).
  R/o 6/969-C3H, Vidyuth Nagar, Rajampeta-516115 Distt-Kadappa (AP).
- 106. R. Tagore Nath Reddy, S/o Sh. R. Prabhakar Reddy, Working as Assistant Engineer AIR, Tirupati (AP). R/o D-1, AIR Staff Quarters, R. C. Road, Tirupati-517501 (AP).
  - 7. G. Guruswamy Reddy, S/o Sh. G. Narayana Reddy Working as Senior Engineeing Assistant, DDK, Tirupati (AP). R/o 4-17/C, Sri Krishna Nagar, M. R. Palli, Tirupati-517502 (AP).

- 108. A. Suresh, S/o Sh. A Jangaiah, Working as Senior Engineeing Assistant, TVRC, Kosgi (Mahaboobnagar), PIN-509339(AP). R/o 7-4-25, Venkateshwara Colony, Mahaboobnagar-509001 (AP).
- 109. Lakshman Prasad Srivastava,
  S/o Late Sh. Harihar Prasad,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  O/o ADG(E), East Zone, AIR & Doordarshan,
  Kolkata (WB).
  R/o H. No.22, Vidyasagar Path, Vliyan, Post-Kadma,
  East Singhbhum (Jharkhand).
- Arvind Kumar Sinha, S/o Late Sh. Gopal Prasad,
   Working as Assistant Engineer,
   HPTV, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand).
   R/o B-4, Doordarshan Colony, Golmuri, Church Road,
   Jamshedpur (Jharkhand).
- Omvir Singh, S/o Bhudev Singh,
   Working as Assistant Engineer,
   HPTV, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand).
   R/o C-2, Doordarshan Colony, Golmuri,
   Jamshedpur (Jharkhand).
- 112. Mrs Alpana Mitra, D/o Late Sh. N. C. Bhadra, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, HPTV, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand).
  R/o- C/o Sh. S. B. Mitra, 50-C, Becharam Chaterjee Road, Behala, Kolkata-700034 (WB).
- Subhash Prasad, S/o Late Sh. Ram Prasad,
   Working as Senior Engineering Assistant,
   HPTV, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand).
   R/o N.I.T., Cooperative Society, Ichhapur (Near DAV Public School), Adityapur-831014.
- 114. Mohd. Tahir, S/o Mohd. Umar, Working as Engineering Assistant, HPTV, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand). R/o H. No.113, Muslim Basti, Golmuri, Jamshedpur-831003.
- 115. Mrs Monisha Nandi, D/o Late Dr. A. K. Dutta, Working as Engineering Assistant, HPTV, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand). R/o AG-3 Bunglow, Indranagar, near Nildil Chowk, Jamshedpur-831008.

Devanand Sharma, S/o Sh. S. N. Sharma, Working as Engineering Assistant, HPTV, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand). R/o Ashok Vihar, Kalpanapuri, Adityapur-1, Sarai Kela-Kharshawar-832109.



- 117. Raja Ram Sharma, S/o Late Sh. R. N. Sharma, Working as Assistant Engineer, TVRC, Ghatsila (Jharkhand).
  R/o H. No. 98, Sindhu Road 10 No. Basti, Golmuri, Jamshedpur-831003 (Jharkhand).
- 118. Rajiv Kumar Jha, S/o Late Sh. B. N. Jha, Working as Engineering Assistant, TVRC, Ghatsila (Jharkhand). R/o D-144, Asiana Suncity, Mongo, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand).
- Yogendra Kumar, S/o Late Sh. Jagdish Sharma,
   Working as Engineering Assistant,
   TVRC, Ghatsila (Jharkhand).
   R/o C-1/1, Akashvani Colony,
   Adityapur, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand).
- 120. Sant Kumar Pandey, S/o Late Sh. R. N. Pandey, Working as Assistant Engineer, TVRC, Saraikela (Jharkhand).
  R/o 6, Saket Vihar Colony, Dhirajganj, Adityapur Industrial Area, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand).
- Shiv Prasad Rastogi, S/o Sh. K. L. Rastogi, Working as Engineering Assistant, TVRC, Saraikela (Jharkhand).
  R/o 86, East Bengal colony, Agrico, Jamshedpur-831009 (Jharkhand).
- 122. Navin Kumar, S/o Late Sh. Ambika Singh, Working as Engineering Assistant, TVRC, Chaibasa (Jharkhand). R/o 40, Bagan Area No.3, New Kashidih, Sakchi, Jamshedpur (Jharkhand).
- 123. Raj Kumar Tripathi, S/o Late Sh. Jagannath Tripathi, Assistant Engineer (Retired), DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand).
  R/o Sarowar Nagar, Devi Mandap, Road, Post-Hehal, Ranchi-834005 (Jharkhand).
- 124. Permeshwer Choudhary, S/o Late Sh. R. S. Choudhary, Assistant Engineer (Retired), DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o 101, SFS, Hermu Housing Colony, Ranchi-834005 (Jharkhand).
  - B. Shashidhara, S/o Sh. R. Bharati Shankar, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka). R/o 34, Next to Creative Villa, RBI Colony, Hebbal post, Bangalore-560024.



- 126. Vaijayanthi S., D/o Sh. L. Raghvendra Rao, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka). R/o 34, Next to Creative Villa, RBI Colony, Hebbal post, Bangalore-560024.
- Punita Ramani, D/o Sh. E. M. Swamy,
  Working as Assistant Engineer,
  DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka).
  R/o 16, 7th Cross, Thimmaiah Garden, R. T. Nagar,
  Bangalore (Karnataka).
- 128. C. A. Anwar, S/o Sh. C. A. Kunhimohammed, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka).
   R/o 61, 1st Main Road, 2nd Cross, Ranka Nagar, Kavalbaisandra New Extn, R.T. Nagar Post, Bangalore-560032.
- S. Sankaran, S/o Sh. T. M. Sundaram,
   Working as Senior Engineering Assistant,
   DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka).
   R/o 5, Sri Venkateswara Temple Street, Matadahalli,
   Bangalore-560032.
- 130. Renuka Devi S., D/o Sh. Balakrishna Pillai P., Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka).
  R/o 4, Maheswaramma Temple Street, Munireddy Palya, J.C. Nagar, Bangalore-560006.
- 131. Johnson K. Maliakal, S/o Sh. M. Kunjavara, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka). R/o 5, S.L.V. Temple Street, Mattadhahalli, Bangalore-560032.
- Roopa T., D/o Sh. T. Karunakaran,
   Working as Senior Engineering Assistant,
   DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka).
   R/o 20/21, J. C. Nagar, M. T. Street,
   Bangalore-560006.
- 133. K. Ananthan, S/o Sh. R. Kalimuthu,
  Working as Senior Engineering Assistant,
  DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka).
  R/o A-21, Prakash Citadel Apartment,
  Munina Gappa Layout,
  R.T. Nagar, Bangalore-560032.

G. Kokila, D/o Sh. P. Govindaraju, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka). R/o A-21, Prakash Citadel Apartment, Munina Gappa Layout, R.T. Nagar, Bangalore-560032.

- 135. P. Ravichandran, S/o Sh. K. Padmanabhan, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka). R/o Old No.2, New No. 17, 20th Street, Ashok Nagar, Chennai-600083.
- D. Dhandapani, S/o Late Sh. V. Devarajan,
   Working as Engineering Assistant,
   DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka).
   R/o 11, 'A' Street, Bowee Lane, Ashok Nagar,
   Bangalore-560025.
- 137. R. Jayakumar, S/o J. Ramanan,
  Working as Engineering Assistant,
  DDK, Bangalore (Karnataka).
  R/o 21, 4th Cross, Muthappa Block, Ganganagar Extn,
  R.T. Nagar Post, Bangalore-560032.
- 138. S. A. S. Dafedar, S/o Sh. Sayed Husain, Assistant Engineer (Retired), AIR, Dharwad (Karnataka). R/o 7th Cross, Laxminagar, Vidyagiri, Dharwad-580004 (Karnataka).
- Ramdhan Ghule, S/o Sh. Samadhan Ghule, Working as Assistant Engineer,
  TVRC, Amalner (under DMC, Jalgaon).
  R/o House No.5, near T. S. Z.ope School,
  Hanuman Nagar,
  Bhusawal-425201 (Jalgaon).
- 140. Jatindra Chandra Das, S/o Sh. Gurucharan Das, Assistant Engineer (Retired), TVRC, Parbhani (under DMC, Nanded). R/o B1/202, Tushar Residency, Rahatni Road, Pimple Soudagar, PO-Audh Camp, Pune-411027.
- 141. Prabhat Kumar Pathak, S/o Bashishtha Pathak, Working as Assistant Engineer,
  O/o ADG(E), West Zone, AIR &DD, Mumbai.
  R/o Vill-Pipra Pathak, Post-Baghan, Lar Road,
  Deoria-274505 (UP).
- 142. Vilas V. Pandit, S/o Sh. V. G. Pandit,
  Working as Assistant Engineer,
  O/o ADG(E), West Zone, AIR &DD, Mumbai.
  R/o 302, Geeta Apartment, behind Joshi High School,
  Dombivli (E), Thane-421201 (Maharashtra).

Laura I. Andrade, D/o Thomas Monteiro, Working as Assistant Engineer, O/o ADG(E), West Zone, AIR &DD, Mumbai. R/o 201, Jeevan Veena, Plot-41, Sector-2, Charkop, Kandivali (W), Mumbai-400067 (M.S.).



- Sibayon Chanda, S/o Larte Sh. S. K. Chanda, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Guwahati (Assam).
  R/o Central Apartment, B. M. Road, Ulubari, Guwahati-781007 (Assam).
- 145. Lal Singh, S/o S. Bhola Ram,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  HPT, AIR, Aligarh (UP).
  R/o 5/108, Sddhartha Nagar,
  Chuharpur, Aligarh-202001 (UP).
- 146. Anoop Kumar Sinha, S/o Sh. Dharm Prakash Sinha, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Varanasi (UP). R/o D3, Doordarshan Colony, Varanasi-221002 (UP).
- 147. Pavitra Mohan Panda, S/o Late Sh. B. B. Panda, Working as Assistant Engineer, TVRC, Sundargarh (Orissa).
  R/o 32/445, Jagda, Sundergarh-769042, Distt-Rourkela (Orissa).
- Debashish Chakraborty, S/o Sh. Manoj Chakraborty, Working as Engineering Assistant,
  TVRC, Rajgangpur (under DMC, Rourkela).
  R/o A/237, Koel Nagar,
  Rourkela-769014 (Orissa).
- 149. Harihar Nayak, S/o Sh. Nisamani Nayak, Working as Engineering Assistant, TVRC, Bonai (under DMC Rourkela). R/o G-20, Sector-1, Rourkela-769008 (Orissa).
- 150. Binoy Kumar Verma, S/o Sh. Ramji Prasad,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  DDK, Patna (Bihar).
  R/o Vill-Chhoti Pahari, Post- Pahari,
  Patna-800007 (Bihar).
- 151. Jagdish Prasad, S/o Late Sh. D. N. Singh,
  Assistant Engineer (Retired),
  DDK, Patna (Bihar).
  R/o 202, Block-B, Ramgovind Enclave, Punaichak,
  Patna-800023 (Bihar).
- 152. Lawrence Tigga, Late Sh. A. K. Tigga, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o Vill-Partadih, Post- Raja Ulhatu, Distt- Ranchi (Jharkhand).

- 153. Sunil Ekka, S/o Late Sh. Sahay Ekka, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o Bara Ghaghra, Moga Bagaicha, Post- Doranda, Distt- Ranchi (Jharkhand).
- Rajesh Nigam, S/o Late Sh. H. P. Shrivastava, Working as Assistant Engineer,
  DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand).
  R/o Doordarshan Colony, Ratu Road,
  Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 155. Ram Kishor Mishra, S/o Sh. R. J. Mishra, Working as Assistant Engineer, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o D-4, Doordarshan Colony, Ratu Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 156. Ashok Kumar Singh, S/o Sh. S. N. Singh, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o B/107, H. H. Colony, Ranchi-834012 (Jharkhand).
- Manoj Kumar Sharma, S/o Sh. R. P. Sharma, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand).
  R/o B-9, Doordarshan Colony, Ratu-Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 158. Yadunandan Paswan, S/o Sh. Mishri Paswan, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o Shiv Durga Mandir Lane, Ratu Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 159. Kabita Behera, D/o Sh. M. P. Behera, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o 203, Sahadeo Enclave, Aryapuri, Distt- Ranchi (Jharkhand).
- 160. Om Prakash, S/o Late Sh. R. K. Prasad, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o 305, Sahadeo Enclave, Aryapuri, Distt- Ranchi (Jharkhand).

Anup Kumar, S/o Sh. Rajendra Choudhary, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o Sahadeo Nagar, Post- Hehal, Ratu Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).

- 162. Kishor Kumar Sahu, S/o Late Sh. P. C. Sahu, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o C/o Late Sh. P. C. Sahu, Kumhar Toli, Irgu Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 163. Pascal Tigga, S/o Sh. Markus Tigga, Working as Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o Sosai Maria Toli, Post- Sosai Ashram Mandar, Distt- Ranchi (Jharkhand).
- 164. Sunil Kumar Yadav, S/o Sh. Ram Chandra Yadav, Working as Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o C-16, Doordarshan Colony, Ratu Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 165. Ajay Kumar, S/o Sh. J. B. Prasad, Working as Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o D-6, Doordarshan Colony, Ratu Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 166. Anuj Kachhap, S/o Late Sh. Puran Kachhap, Working as Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand).
  R/o Hind Piri, 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, Mali Tola, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 167. Anmol Deepak Khalkho, S/o Late Sh. H. Khalkho, Working as Engineering Assistant, DDK, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o 384, Judge Colony, Road No. 8, Kalyanpur, Singh More, Hatia, Ranchi-834003 (Jharkhand).
- 168. Kolha Kachhap, S/o Sh. Sohrai Kachhap, Working as Assistant Engineer, AIR, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o C/o AIR, Ratu Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 169. Chandra Kumar, S/o Late Sh. C. P. Singh, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, AIR, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o C/o AIR, Ratu Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 170. Dinesh Prasad Keshari, S/o Late Sh. Moti Sah, Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, AIR, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o C/o AIR, Ratu Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).
- 171. Rajesh Kumar, S/o Late Sh. S. N. Ojha,



Working as Senior Engineering Assistant, AIR, Ranchi (Jharkhand). R/o G2, Bageshwari Apartment, Aryapuri, Ratu Road, Ranchi-834001 (Jharkhand).

- 172. Tarkeshwar Manjhi, S/o Sh. Fulena Manjhi, Working as Engineering Assistant, AIR, Ranchi (Jharkhand).
  R/o Baithania, Near Lohar Daga Railway Crossing, Dibadih,
  Post-Doranda, Ranchi-834002.
- 173. V. Prabakharan, S/o Sh. Victor Swamidoss Assistant Engineer (retired), ADG (E), South Zone, AIR & DD, Chennai, R/o SF5, Sri Krishna Apartments, No.132 (88), M.K. Amman Koil Street, Mylapore, Chennai-600004.
- Mangalam Prabakaran, D/o Sh. V. Yagnaswami,
  Assistant Engineer (retired),
  ADG (E), South Zone, AIR & DD, Chennai,
  R/o SF5, Sri Krishna Apartments, No.132 (88),
  M.K. Amman Koil Street, Mylapore, Chennai-600004.
- U. M. Subramanian, S/o late Sh. S. Muthusamy, Assistant Engineer (retired),
  ADG (E), South Zone, AIR & DD, Chennai,
  17, Lakshmi Ammal Lay Out, Sowthamalar Ext.,
  Arts College Road, Udumalpet-642126.
- 176. V. Sivarajan, S/o Late Sh. R. Venugopalan,
  Assistant Engineer (retired),
  ADG (E), South Zone, AIR & DD, Chennai,
  R/o A-20, H.M. Paradise, New/Old No.40/172, Big Street,
  Triplicane, Chennai-600005.
- 177. P. Sekaran, S/o K. Ponnuswamy, Assistant Engineer (retired), ADG (E), South Zone, AIR & DD, Chennai, R/o D-22, New 21, 16th Cross Street, Hindu Colony, Nanganllur, Chennai-60061.

....Applicants

(By Advocate: Shri Yogesh Sharma)

#### versus



Union of India, through the Secretary, Ministry of Information & Broadcasting, Govt. of India, Shastri Bhawan, Dr. R.P. Marg, New Delhi-110001.

Prasar Bharati (Broadcasting Corp. of India), Through Chief Executive Officer, PTl Building, Sansad Marg, New Delhi-110001.

- 3. Director General, Akashvani, Akashvani Bhawan, Sansad Marg, New Delhi-110001.
- 4. Director General, Doordarshan, Doordarshan Bhawan, Wing-A, Copernicus Marg, New Delhi-110001.

....Respondents

(By Advocate: Ms. Parween Shabnam for Shri S.M.Arif)

### ORDER (ORAL)

## SHRI G. GEORGE PARACKEN, MEMBER (J):

The applicants have filed this OA seeking direction to the respondents to grant 1st financial upgradation in the pay scale of Rs.8000-275-13500 after completion of 12 years of service counting it from the date of direct recruitment in service and thereafter, 2nd financial upgradation in the pay scale of Rs.10000-325-15200 after completion of 24 years of service in accordance with the Scheme of ACP with effect from the dates in each individual cases along with arrears of pay and consequential benefits.

that their cases is squarely covered by the Order of the Patna Bench of this Tribunal in OA No.514/2002 – Akashwani & Doordarshan Diploma Engineers Association through its president name Brij Kishore Roy and others vs. Union of India and others decided on 7.9.2009. The said Order being short one is reproduced as under:



"The applicants are working as Engineering Assistant, Sr. Engineering Assistant and Assistant Engineers in the Prasar Bharti, Patna. They are working in the pay scale of Rs.6,500-10500 since the implementation of the 5th Pay Commission in 1996. The Engineering Assistants and Sr. Engineering Assistants were in a lower scale

before the coming of the 4th Central Pay Commission, i.e., before 1986. They had filed cases in Central Administrative Tribunal for their up-gradation to a higher level. This was ultimately achieved after a prolonged litigation with the Hon'ble Court putting their seal of approval. Thereafter all the three categories officials who are the applicants in this case were placed in the same scale of Rs.2000-3500 before 1996 and consequently in the pay scale of 6,500-10500 after 1996. Since they have completed 12 years of service in the same pay scale they are seeking ACP promotions which is sanctioned by the Govt. of India in 1998.

- 2. The respondents have not replied to the repeated representation made by the applicants for grant of ACP and thereafter they filed this OA. Since the respondents did not reply to the representations, there is no impugned order in this case. The reluctance of the respondents to grant them ACP promotion is now clear, on perusal of the written statement which they have filed.
- Shri S.K. Tiwari, ld. ASC for the respondents reiterates the points what have been high-lighted in their written statement and explains why ACP promotions have been refused to these applicants. The learned counsel for the respondents says that the applicants have already enjoyed a number of up-gradations in the last few years and, therefore, they are not entitled for any ACP benefits which were admissible to only such employees who have stagnated in the same pay scale for many years. The learned counsel for the respondents says that initially the Engineering Assistants were in the grade of Rs.425-700. Thereafter, they were granted the pay scale of Rs.5000-8000 and thereafter Rs.6500-10500. The learned counsel for the respondents says that in view of this situation they cannot be granted any further higher pay scale through ACP.
- 4. The learned counsel for the applicant draws our attention to the DOPT O.M. No.35034/97 Estt.(D) dated 10.2.2000 I which the DOPT clarified certain points of doubts which could arise while granting ACP benefits. The learned counsel for the applicant says that this case is completely covered by the clarifications given by the DOPT on the point of doubts raised. The DOPT clarifications are as follows:-



1

"Two posts carrying different pay scales constituting two rungs in a hierarchy have now been placed in the same pay-scale as a result of rationalizaton of pay-scales. This has resulted into change in the hierarchy in as much as two posts which constituted feeder and promotion grades in the premerged scenario have become one grade. The position may be clarified further by way of the following illustration: prior to the implementation of the Fifth Central Pay Commission recommendation, two categories of posts were in the pay-scales of Rs.1200-1800 and Rs.1320-2040 respectively; the latter being promotion post for the former. Both the posts have now been placed in the pay-scale of Rs.4000-6000. How the benefits of the ACP Scheme is to be allowed in such cases?"

#### Clarification

"Since the benefits of upgradation under ACP Scheme (ACPS) are to be allowed in the existing hierarchy, the mobility under ACPS shall be in the hierarchy existing after merger of pay scales by ignoring the promotion. An employee who got promoted from lower pay-scale to higher pay-scale as a result of promotion before merger of pay scales shall be entitled for upgradation under ACPS ignoring the said promotion as otherwise he would be placed in a disadvantageous position vis-à-vis the fresh entrants in the merged grade.

- 5. On perusal of this clarification given by the DOPT, Shri S.K. Tiwari, learned counsel for the respondents concedes that the up-gradation granted to the Engineering Assistants and the Sr. Engineering Assistants earlier have to be ignored while considering grant of ACP promotions to the applicants.
- 6. The next point which was argued by both the counsels was that if the applicants have to be granted ACP then what should be the scale in which they should be granted ACP. Both the sides agreed that since 6500-10500 is the pay scale of Assistant Engineer, the ACP promotion should be in the pay scale of the next post in the hierarchy i.e. the post of Assistant Executive Engineer i.e. Rs.8000-13500.



- 7. The learned counsel for the applicant also quotes from the DOPT circular dated 10.2.2000 mentioned earlier clarifying the points under ACP Scheme. In this order, it has been clarified that the mobility under ACP is to be allowed under existing hierarchy.
- 8. After hearing both the counsels and after perusing the records, we have come to the conclusion that the applicants are entitled for grant of ACP promotion and this promotion should be granted in the pay scale of Assistant Executive Engineer i.e. Rs.8000-13500.
- 9. This O.A. is therefore, allowed. The respondents are directed to grant the applicants the pay scale of Rs.8000-13500 as and when they have completed 12 years service in the pay scale of Rs.6500-10500. The arrears should also be paid to the applicants. The respondents are directed to issue orders regarding ACP promotion to the applicants within a period of two months from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment. The arrears may be calculated and paid to them within one month thereafter.
- 10. With these directions, this O.A. stands disposed of. No costs."
- 3. Learned counsel for the applicants has also submitted that the aforesaid Order was challenged before the Hon'ble High Court of Judicature at Patna vide CWJC No.6451 of 2010 and the same was dismissed vide Order/Judgment dated 25.8.2010. The said judgment is also reproduced as under:-

"Heard the parties.



On merits, there is no dispute that the Tribunal has correctly appreciated the clarification contained in DOPT dated 10.2.2000 which is fully discussed in paragraph 4 of the impugned order of the learned Central Administrative Tribunal, Patna Bench, Patna dated 7.9.2010 passed in OA No.514 of 2002. In paragraph 5 of that order, the learned Tribunal has recorded that on perusal of clarification given by the DOPT, the counsel for the



respondent conceded that the up-graciation granted to the Engineering Assistants and the Sr. Engineering Assistants earlier have to be ignored while considering grant of ACP promotions to the applicants. We were taken through the scheme of ACP available on record which contains OM No.35034/1/97, dated 9.8.1999 of Department of Personnel and Training. We find that Annexure-I to the said notification contains conditions for grant of benefits under ACP Scheme and as per condition no.5.1 the two financial up-gradations under the ACP scheme are to be made available to an employee only if he has not received regular promotion/promotions during the relevant period.

We have also been taken through the DOPT dated 10.2.2000 which is Annexure-4 to the supplementary affidavit filed on behalf of the petitioners. The clarification is clear and not in dispute. It provides that an employee who got promotion from lower pay scale to higher pay scale as a result of promotion before merger of pay scales, shall be entitled for up-gradation under ACPS ignoring the said promotion as otherwise he would be placed disadvantageous position vis-à-vis the fresh entrant in the merger grade.

The clarification is clearly for answering a doubt and the views of the authorities by way of clarification cannot be questioned by the petitioners. The learned Tribunal has rightly accepted the clarification.

We find some substance in the submissions advanced on behalf of the petitioners that the learned Tribunal in paragraph 9 of the impugned order should have directed the authorities only to consider the case of the applicants for grant of benefits under the ACP on completing 12 years of service in accordance with the scheme of ACP and the clarification contained in DOPT dated 10.2.2010. In our view also, the learned Tribunal should not have issued a general direction to cover cases of all the individuals because under the ACP scheme cases of individuals require consideration. Now, once the doubts relating to cases of the employees have been cleared, they are directed to consider the grant of benefit of ACPS to the applicants before the Tribunal within a period of three months from today in accordance with law and the observations made



in this order and the order of the learned Tribunal."

- 4. He has also stated that the aforesaid Judgment has not been interfered by the Apex Court in SLP (Civil) No.CC 20212/2010 filed against it.
- 5. Thereafter the respondents have filed a Civil Review No.141/2012 before the Hon'ble High Court of Judicature at Patna seeking review of its Judgment dated 28.5.2010 but the same was also dismissed vide Order dated 23.10.2013. The said Order is reproduced as under:-

"I.A. No.7306 of 2013 has been filed for condoning the delay in filing the instant review application.

In view of the averments made in the limitation petition, we are inclined to condone the delay in filing the review application.

In the circumstances, I.A. No.7306/2013 is allowed and the delay in filing the review application is condoned.

The petitioners have filed the instant application for review of the order dated 25.8.2010 passed in C.W.J.C. No.6451 of 2010 by a Division Bench of this Court. A copy of the order has been annexed as Annexure-1. The Division Bench while affirming the order of the learned Tribunal observed that the Tribunal should not have issued a general direction to cover cases of all the individuals because under the ACP scheme cases of individuals require consideration. The order of Division Bench was unsuccessfully challenged before the Hon'ble Apex Court.

The petitioners submitted that the learned Tribunal has passed order dated 8.12.2011 in CCPA No.22 of 2011 purported to be in terms of Order of Division Bench.

The petitioners in fact have tried to question the validity of the said order and being conscious about the limitation in challenging the order dated 8.12.2011 passed in CCPA no.22 of 2011 in Review Application, seek to withdraw this Review application to challenge the same before an appropriate authority.

This review application is accordingly dismissed as withdrawn."





- 11.3.2014 directing them to file reply and the case was adjourned to 1.4.2014. On 1.4.2014, the respondents were granted further four weeks' time to file reply and the case was directed to be listed under the heading 'Ready for Hearing Matters' for today. However, no reply has been filed by the respondents till date and the counsel appearing for the respondents' counsel sought further time to file reply.
- 7. In our considered view no further adjournment of this case is necessary. Let the respondents examine the cases of the applicants in the light of the aforesaid Order/Judgments and decide the matter. In case, their cases are covered by the aforesaid Order/Judgment, they shall also be given the same benefits. In any case, the respondents shall communicate their decision to the applicants by a reasons and speaking order within two months from the date of receipt of a copy of this Order.
- 8. This OA is accordingly disposed of. There shall be no order as to costs.

MEMBER (A)

/ravi/



(G. GEORGE PARACKEN) MEMBER (J)

Free Copy U/R 22 of CAT (Procedure Rules) प्रमाणित सत्यव्यतिलिपि CERTIFIED TRUE COPY दिनाँक/Dated.....

अनुमान शिकारी (न्याः) Section Officer (J) केन्द्रीय प्रशासनिक अधिकरण Central Administrative Tribunal प्रधान न्यायपीठ, नई दिल्ली Principal Branch, New Delhi